

12th February 2007

Shri M. Rajamani
Joint Secretary (UD & A)
Ministry of Urban Development
Room No. 140, C Wing
Nirman Bhawan
Maulana Azad Road
New Delhi – 110011

Dear Sir:

Subject: Appeal – RTI Application No. 16(7)/UD/JNNURM/2006/1316

In the above RTI request, I had requested for a copy of the Delhi CDP. The request was declined on the grounds that the CDP would be made public only after the Government of India accepts it. The appeal is against this response.

In the same response, I was informed that the CDP was finalised after a single consultation with civil society organisations which was held on 8th September 2006. The inputs from that consultation went into making the CDP. We were told that there would be one more round of consultations to discuss the CDP but there were no such consultations.

Ideally, a CDP should be finalised only after consultations have been carried out with all stakeholders. The spirit of the consultations is lost if the CDP is made public only after the GOI accepts it.

I request you to encourage dialogue and discussion over the CDP by requiring it to be made public under this RTI request. I trust you will see the merit in my argument.

Yours sincerely,

Makarand Bakore
Centre for Civil Society
K-36, Hauz Khas Enclave
New Delhi 110016
Phone: 26537456 / 9312444725
Email: makarand@ccs.in

12th February 2007

Shri Aniruddha Kumar
Director (JNNURM)
Ministry of Urban Development
Room No. 138, C Wing
Nirman Bhawan
Maulana Azad Road
New Delhi – 110011

Dear Sir:

Subject: Right to information application

I understand that M/s. IL & FS, Eco Smart Ltd. was contracted out the work of preparing the CDP for Delhi. Kindly provide the following information in this regard:

1. What was the process of selecting the private company?
2. Which were the other companies that pitched for the contract?
3. What were the bids of the other companies?
4. What were the factors that were in favour of IL & FS?
5. In spite of having planning departments in the Government, why was the work contracted out to a private entity?

Yours sincerely,

Makarand Bakore
Centre for Civil Society
K-36, Hauz Khas Enclave
New Delhi 110016
Phone: 26537456 / 9312444725
Email: makarand@ccs.in

(10)

DEPARTMENT OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT
GOVERNMENT OF NCT OF DELHI
9th LEVEL, C-WING, DELHI SACHIVALYA
I.P. ESTATE : NEW DELHI-110002

NO. F. 16(7)/UD/JNNURM/2006-4645

DATED 21/03/2007

To

✓ Addl. Secretary (UD)
Deptt. of Urban Development,
Govt. of NCT of Delhi,
10th Level, C-Wing, Delhi Secretariat,

Sub : Providing information under RTI Act, 2005 Vide I.D. No.195

Sir,

This is with reference to the subject cited above Sh. Makarand Bakore vide his letter dated 12th February 2007, has filed an appeal in Ministry of Urban Development, Govt. of India, against the reply given to him that the copy of CDP will be made available only after it is accepted by the Govt. of India. The applicant may however be advised to inspect the proposed CDP and take copy as per rules if he so desires. The para-wise reply of his second letter is as under-

1. The selection was done through open advertisement in the leading Newspapers.
2. At the closing date thirty companies submitted their application. The list is enclosed at Annexure-I.
3. The bids of the other companies were higher than the bids of IL&FS.
4. The lowest bid went in favour of IL&FS.
5. Since the process of open advertisement was followed, the selection was done from the thirty applications submitted.

Yours faithfully,



(PRADEEP BAIJAL)
DY. SECRETARY (JNNURM)
DATED- /03/2007

24241181P
27/3
URGENT
NO. F. 18(7)/UD/JNNURM/2007/-

Copy forwarded for information please:-

1. Sh. N. Venugopalan, Dy. Secretary to the Government of India, NURM Directorate, Ministry of Urban Development, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.



(PRADEEP BAIJAL)
DY. SECRETARY (JNNURM)

Reply urgent by

22/3
AD/O/ 22/3
AD (RTI) 24/3
MS Vidya

ANNEXURE-I

LIST OF OFFERS FOR CONSULTANTS

1. Shah Technical Consultants Pvt. Ltd., Consulting Engineers, 407, Raheja Centre, Plot No. 214, Nariman Point, Mumbai-400021 :
2. Deccan Consulting Engineers Private Limited, B-98/5A (3rd Floor), Joshi Colony, Behind BALCO Market, I.P. Extension, Delhi-110092
3. Frischman Prabhu (India) Pvt. Ltd., 315, Balgovind Wadi, New Prabhadevi Road, Pravadevi, Mumbai-400025
4. TCE Consulting Engineers Limited, Matulya Centre, A 249, Senapati Bapat Marg, Lower Parel (West) Mumbai-400013
5. Intercontinental Consultants and Technocrats Pvt. Ltd., A-8, Green Park, New Delhi-110016
6. Engineers India Limited, 1, Bhikaiji Cama Place, R.K. Puram, New Delhi-110066
7. MDP Consultants (P) Ltd., C-154, Greater Kailash-I, New Delhi-110048
8. Shrishti Urban Infrastructure Development Limited, F-13, Kailash Colony, New Delhi-110048
9. High Point Rendel (India) Pvt. Ltd., C-110, Ground Floor, NDSE-Part-II, New Delhi-110049
10. WAPCOS (I) LTD., 76-C, Sector-18 Institutional Area Gurgaon-122015
11. Price Water House Coopers Pvt. Ltd., PWC Centre, Saidullajab, opp. D Bock, Saket, Mehrauli Badarpur Road, New Delhi-30
12. National Consultancy for Planning and Engineering Infrastructure Designers and Planners, 9-4-131/17/A, Tombs Road, Akaber Bagh Toli Chauki Haidrabad-500008
13. MIPS, 511, Janakpuri, District Centre, New Delhi
14. STUT Consultants Pvt. Ltd. 1112, Vishal Tower Janakpuri, District Centre, New Delhi-58
15. Tetra Tech India Ltd. E-7/14, Vasant Vihar, New Delhi-57
16. OASIS Designs Incorporated, Architects, Environment Landscape Consultants 3172 Sector-A, Pocket- B, Vasnt Kunj, New Delhi-70
17. Ramky Infra Consulting Pvt. Ltd., DLF Phase-IV, Gurgaon
18. Teri the Energy and Resources Institute IHC Complex, Lodhi Road, New Delhi
19. The Louis Berger Group, Inc., USA, Slushant Lok-1 Gurgaon: Submitted the expression of interest with the detailed enclosures.
20. LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd., Mathura Road, New Delhi
21. Fairwood Consultants Pvt. Ltd., Delhi Blue Apartments Safdarjang, Ring Road, New Delhi
22. PPC, Park Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd., Ashok Vihar, Phase-I, New Delhi
23. Feedback Ventures Pvt. Ltd. Punchshil Park, New Delhi
24. Consulting Engineering Services (I) Pvt. Ltd., Nehru Place, New Delhi
25. Rites Ltd., Rites Bhawan, Sector-29, Gurgaon, Haryana
26. CRISIL Infrastructure Advisory CRISIL LTD. Kasturba Gandhi, Marg, New Delhi
27. IL& FS LTD., New Delhi
28. M.N. Ashish Ganju Architects, Aya Nagar, Phase-5, New Delhi
29. Society for Development Studies, India Habituate Centre Lodhi Road, New Delhi
30. BCEOM Societe Francaise D'Ingenierie in association with CRAPHTS (I) Pvt. Ltd., and BCEOM India Pvt. Ltd., Panchshil Park, New Delhi