

## Minutes of Delhi CSO Discussion on JNNURM

First floor, Conference Room  
Voluntary Action Network India (VANI)  
BB-5, Greater Kailash Enclave,  
New Delhi – 110048

Date & Time: 27 July 2006, 3 pm – 5 pm

Facilitator: Makarand Bakore

Purpose: Meeting of *Group A – Decentralisation* to discuss the 74<sup>th</sup> Amendment

### 1.0 Outcomes

1. Mrs. Savita Sharma of VANI to correspond with Mr. Ramesh Ramanathan of the Nation Technical Advisory Group (TAG) regarding the following
  - a. To clarify the standing of the Delhi TAG and our institutional space in consultation with the government regarding JNNURM.
  - b. To stop the signing of MoUs for the state of Delhi till meaningful consultations have been made with all stakeholders by the Government.
2. Group to translate JNNURM documents in Hindi for information dissemination.
3. Ms. D Leena to give a short introduction to the Madhya Pradesh Patta Act 1998 at a future meeting.
4. Date for next meeting: **Tuesday, 1<sup>st</sup> August 2006, 10 am – 5 pm**

|               |                |                               |
|---------------|----------------|-------------------------------|
| <b>Agenda</b> | <b>Group B</b> | Land Reform                   |
|               | <b>Group D</b> | Basic Services for Urban Poor |

**Venue:** Mobile Creches, DIZ area, Sector IV, Raja Bazar, Gole Market, Connaught Place.

**Contact persons:** Leena 9811137421, leena2112@yahoo.com  
Makarand 9312444725, makarand@ccsindia.org

5. **Date for next to next meeting:** First week of August. Date to be finalised.

The meeting will be in co-ordination with Sajha Manch. It is intended to maximise the participation of the urban poor in the JNNURM consultation process.

6. **Online JNNURM Delhi Yahoo! Group** has been created. Minutes of meetings and other documents are available on the Yahoo! Group for public access. The group can be joined via the following link:  
<http://groups.yahoo.com/group/jnnurmdelhi/>

## 2.0 Discussions

1. Makarand Bakore made a presentation on the 74<sup>th</sup> Constitutional Amendment and its implementation under the Delhi Municipal Corporation Act 1957. Soft copy of this presentation to be emailed with the minutes and uploaded on the Yahoo! Group.
2. Mr. Prashant
  - a. The provision for revenue sharing under the 74<sup>th</sup> Amendment is vague. The State Finance Commission is not neutral as it is appointed by the State.
  - b. The Amendment should lay out what percentage of the revenue collection should go to the Municipalities.
3. Mr. Sansar Chandra
  - a. (Narrated the actions taken by the UPA government with regard to the 74<sup>th</sup> Amendment after it came to power in 2004.) Mr. Mani Shankar Iyer had a meeting on 9<sup>th</sup> June where civil society organisation raised the issue of District Planning Committees not being formed. Follow-up meetings of Mr. Iyer with Chief Ministers yielded no results. This shows that States are not interested in implementing the provisions of the 74<sup>th</sup> Amendment.
  - b. States want to ensure that finances are routed through them so that they have the funds to their disposal.
  - c. Zonal consultations by Mr. Iyer on Article 243 have borne no fruits so far.
4. Ms. Diya Mehra
  - a. Its important to understand our role in the consultation process for JNNURM in Delhi. The MoU to be signed by the Delhi State Government with the Central Government should be available for scrutiny by civil society.
5. Ms. Suchi Pandey
  - a. Our consultations should be more inclusive. How do we choose the participants for this kind of meeting?  
*Makarand's response:* We have informed all civil society organisations on our database and asked them to forward the invite to other organisations, who might be interested in JNNURM. All participants are encouraged to invite their contacts. The JNNURM Yahoo! Group provides public access to all documents and minutes to all.
  - b. We should bring out small pamphlets (*Parchas*) which provide a gist of JNNURM. They can outline 'What can be done' and should mention a list of topics that can be discussed.

6. Mr. Himmat Singh
  - a. Such consultations should be more inclusive. The urban poor are big stake-holders in JNNURM and should be invited for these meetings
  - b. It is the government's responsibility to spread awareness of the 74<sup>th</sup> Amendment in the people.
  
7. Mr. Sadre Alam
  - a. Poor do not have access to internet. Some don't have a permanent address
  - b. Meeting should be held in a central place. VANI's office is inaccessible by bus.
  - c. Inputs of the poor on the 74<sup>th</sup> Amendment should be solicited
  - d. Hindi translation of all JNNURM documents is necessary.
  - e. There are different types of habitats in Delhi viz.
    - i. Poor people's colonies
    - ii. Authorised colonies
    - iii. Rehabilitated colonies
    - iv. Unauthorised colonies
    - v. Homeless people
  - f. Classification is possible on the basis of employment such as organised sector and unorganised sector.
  - g. We should ensure that consultations should be held systematically with all the above groups.
  
8. Ms. D Leena
  - a. We should clarify with the national TAG the purpose and the standing of the Delhi state TAG.
  - b. We should have an institutionalised space for participation.
  - c. Translation of JNNURM documents in Hindi is a must but also a challenge.
  - d. (Leena distributed copies of the Madhya Pradesh Patta Act [Madhya Pradesh Ordinance No. 3 of 1998] and comments on the *Community Participation Bill*)
  
9. Mrs. Savita Sharma
  - a. As a Delhi State TAG, we should come out with a document with concrete suggestions that can be handed over to the national TAG.
  - b. The document can reflect the voice of the Delhi civil society organisations.
  
10. Mr. Lalit Batra
  - a. City Development Plans (CDPs) should have the involvement of the poor.
  - b. Creations of all CDPs should be halted till such consultations have taken place.
  
11. Ms. Shanta Tufani
  - a. There is no place for Delh's poor in the Delhi Master Plan.

### 3.0 Participants

| No. | Name                 | Designation        | Organisation  | Phone #                   | Email  |
|-----|----------------------|--------------------|---|---------------------------|--|
| 1   | Ms. Paramjeet Kaur   | Director           | Aashray Adhikar Abhiyan                               | 9312668807                | creatinghomes@yahoo.co.uk                                  |
| 2   | Mr. Sanjay Kr.       | Coordinator        | Aashray Adhikar Abhiyan                               | 9820711644                | sanjaykrishna2005@yahoo.co.in;<br>creatinghome@yahoo.co.uk |
| 3   | Mr. Himmat Singh     | Representative     | Abhyudaya   | 55146954                  | abhyudaya.delhi@gmail.com<br>ratidelhi@gmail.com           |
| 4   | Ms. Shanta Tufani    |                    | Ankur   | 26521411/<br>26523495     |  |
| 5   | Mr. Makarand Bakore  | Research Associate | Centre for Civil Society                              | 9312444725                | makarand@ccsindia.org                                      |
| 6   | Ms. Susanne Cassel   | Intern             | Centre for Civil Society                              | 9910169664                | scassel@web.de   |
| 7   | Mr. Shashi B. Pandit |                    | Chintan – Harit Recyclers Association                 | 9350271397                | shashi.pandit@gmail.com                                    |
| 8   | Ms. D Leena          |                    | Hazards Centre  | 9811137421                | leena2112@yahoo.com  |
| 9   | Mr. Lalit Batra      |                    | Independent Researcher associated with Hazards Centre | 9899091413                | lalitbatra@gmail.com                                       |
| 10  | Ms. Suchi Pande      |                    | Independent Researcher                                | 9811333041                | suchi_pande@yahoo.com                                      |
| 11  | Mr. M.V. Bijulal     | Researcher         | Indian Social Institute                               | 24622379                  | bijulaal@gmail.com   |
| 12  | Mr. Sansar Chandra   | Chairman           | Internation Research Centre for Current Affair        | 9211013755,<br>9868225860 | sansar.chandra@gmail.com                                   |
| 13  | Santosh Yadav        | General Secretary  | Lok Panchayat   | 9213615996                |  |
| 14  | Mr. Ishwar Sharma    | Social worker      | Nirman Mazadoor Panchayat Sangam                      | 9818801823                | NMPsdelhi@sify.com   |
| 15  | Mr. Gaurav Gogoi     | Associate          | Pravah  | 9871916477                | mail@pravah.org  |

| <b>No.</b> | <b>Name</b>         | <b>Designation</b>      | <b>Organisation</b>               | <b>Phone #</b> | <b>Email</b>             |
|------------|---------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------|--------------------------|
| 16         | Mr. Prashant Narang |                         | Prabodh / CCS                     | 9811322297     | prashantnarang@yahoo.com |
| 17         | Mr. Sadre Alam      |                         | Sajha Manch                       | 9868078123     | mosadral@yahoo.com       |
| 18         | Mr. Ashok Kumar     |                         | Satarknagrik Sangathan            | 9811420295     | sns@snsindia.org         |
| 19         | Ms. Diya Mehra      | Student                 | University of Texas, Austin       | 9891312908     | diyamehra@gmail.com      |
| 20         | Mrs. Savita Sharma  | National<br>Coordinator | Voluntary Action Network<br>India | 41435536       | savita@vaniindia.org     |